# 7 Ozone Response to Precursor Controls in Very Complex Terrains: Use of Photochemical Indicators to Assess O<sub>3</sub>-NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs Sensitivity in the Northeastern Iberian Peninsula

Published as Jiménez, P., Baldasano, J.M., 2004. Ozone response to precursor controls in very complex terrains: Use of photochemical indicators to assess O<sub>3</sub>-NO<sub>x</sub>-VOC sensitivity in the northeastern Iberian Peninsula. Journal of Geophysical Research, **109**, D20309, doi: 10.1029/2004JD004985.

### 7.1 Introduction

The kinetics of ozone (O<sub>3</sub>) chemistry and its two main precursors, nitrogen oxides (NO<sub>x</sub>) and volatile organic compounds (VOCs) represents an important field of uncertainty in atmospheric chemistry and photochemical modeling (Atkinson, 2000). It is generally known that under some conditions, O<sub>3</sub> concentrations increase with increasing NO<sub>x</sub> and are largely insensitive to VOCs, while for other conditions the rate of formation will increase with increasing VOCs and will be unchanged or decrease with increasing NO<sub>x</sub>. This complexity affects the design of control strategies to reduce tropospheric O<sub>3</sub> production, and considerable interest exists in finding observable indicators of how real air masses are likely to respond to emission controls. A major problem for the study of O<sub>3</sub>-NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs sensitivity has been the inability to gain evidence based on direct measurements rather than theoretical calculations (Sillman, 1999). This problem has been especially critical when different models have given contradictory results on the effectiveness of NO<sub>x</sub> versus VOCs control.

Milford *et al.* (1994) developed an approach for evaluating NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs sensitivity. They found that model predictions for NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs sensitivity were linked to simulated concentrations of a number of key species. VOC-sensitive ozone in models is associated with afternoon values of total reactive nitrogen (NO<sub>y</sub>) above a certain threshold concentration, while NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitivity ozone was associated with lower NO<sub>y</sub>. Sillman (1995) and Sillman *et al.* (1998) extended the work of Milford *et al.* (1994) in order to include other indicator species and ratios: O<sub>3</sub>/NO<sub>y</sub>, O<sub>3</sub>/NO<sub>z</sub> (where NO<sub>z</sub> is defined as NO<sub>y</sub>-NO<sub>x</sub>), and H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>/HNO<sub>3</sub>. In recent years, a number of works have deepened in the analysis of photochemical indicators that determine the split into VOC-sensitive and NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive regimes (Tonnesen and Dennis, 2000a, 2000b; Blanchard and Stoeckenius, 2001; Blanchard and Fairley, 2001; Sillman and He, 2002; Sillman *et al.*, 2003; among others). Nevertheless, it is still unclear whether the indicator ratios would show similar behavior for a wide variety of conditions.

Blanchard *et al.* (1999) and Blanchard and Stoeckenius (2001) used the extent of reaction parameter (EOR) to describe how far a system has proceeded towards its maximum possible  $O_3$  production, with the transition from radical- to NO<sub>x</sub>-limitation typically occurring when the extent of reaction is 0.9 (dimensionless units). EOR was derived from smog chamber experiments and is based on the finding that  $O_3$  in photochemically aged air is sensitive to NO<sub>x</sub> while air with relatively unprocessed emissions is sensitive to VOCs. Box-model and three-dimensional model simulations indicate that when the extent of reaction remains below ~0.6 during the hours of peak ozone,  $O_3$  formation is limited by the availability of radicals, rather than NO<sub>x</sub>, and  $O_3$  concentrations respond to changes in VOCs levels (Blanchard and Fairley, 2001).

Here we show results from model calculations that relate NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs sensitivity in as very complex an area as the northeastern Iberian Peninsula. We use a three-dimensional air quality model (MM5-EMICAT2000-CMAQ) to represent O<sub>3</sub> formation and transport. A series of scenarios are analyzed in order to establish their chemical regime. Using the model to study three different scenarios gives the opportunity to compare the variation of indicator values in each zone and to check whether O<sub>3</sub> values react consistently to similar changes in emissions. Correlations between model species concentrations and NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs sensitivity predictions are examined to see whether commonly employed indicators can be correlated with NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs sensitivity in the case of northeastern Iberian Peninsula. This O<sub>3</sub> sensitivity analysis provides an evaluation of NO<sub>x</sub> and VOCs hypothetical control policies through a comparison of simulated correlation between the species.

### 7.2 The Use of Indicator Species

The split between NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive and VOC-sensitive conditions is well known. For conditions with relatively high VOCs and low NO<sub>x</sub>, O<sub>3</sub> increases with increasing NO<sub>x</sub> and is relatively insensitive to changes in VOCs. For conditions with relatively low VOCs and high NO<sub>x</sub>, O<sub>3</sub> increases with increasing VOCs and decreases with increasing NO<sub>x</sub>. An analogous split between "NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive" and "NO<sub>x</sub>-saturated" regimes occurs in the remote troposphere, although for remote conditions O<sub>3</sub> increases with increasing VOCs even in the NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive regime (Sillman and He, 2002). These phenomena are driven by the complex ozone chemistry.

The split between NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive and VOC-sensitive regimes is driven by the chemistry of odd hydrogen radicals. The NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs split is attributed to the relative rate of formation of peroxides (via HO<sub>2</sub>-HO<sub>2</sub> and HO<sub>2</sub>-RO<sub>2</sub> reactions) relative to nitric acid formation (via reaction OH + NO<sub>2</sub>). NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive conditions occur when peroxides dominate over nitric acid as radical sinks, while NO<sub>x</sub>-saturated conditions occur when nitric acid dominates (Sillman, 1999).

 $NO_x$ -VOCs sensitivity is attributed to the relative source strengths of odd hydrogen radicals (S<sub>H</sub>) and odd nitrogen (S<sub>N</sub>), summed over the period of O<sub>3</sub> production for an air parcel (Sillman and

He, 2002). VOC-sensitive chemistry occurs when the odd nitrogen source exceeds the source of odd hydrogen. According to Kleinman *et al.* (1997), the instantaneous rate of O<sub>3</sub> production is VOC-sensitive whenever the instantaneous loss rate for odd nitrogen (L<sub>N</sub>) is greater then half of the total odd hydrogen source (L<sub>N</sub>/Q > 0.5). Odd hydrogen sources must be in steady state with its three major sinks (equation 7.1):

$$S_{H} = 2P_{perox} + P_{HNO3} + P_{PANS}$$
(7.1)

where  $P_{perox}$  and  $P_{HNO3}$  represent production rates for peroxides (including H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> and organic peroxides) and HNO<sub>3</sub>, and  $P_{PANS}$  represents net photochemical production of peroxyacetyl nitrate (PAN) and higher order analogues. VOC-sensitive chemistry would occur whenever  $P_{HNO3}$  exceeds  $2P_{perox}$ . The NO<sub>x</sub>-VOC split is mainly associated with formation of nitric acid but is not greatly affected by formation of PAN. Sensitivity transition from NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive to VOC-sensitive conditions can be defined in equation 7.2 (Sillman and He, 2002):

$$\frac{1}{Q_{N}}\frac{\partial[O_{3}]}{\partial Q_{N}} = \frac{1}{Q_{H}}\frac{\partial[O_{3}]}{\partial Q_{H}}$$
(7.2)

where  $[O_3]$  represents ozone concentrations and  $Q_N$  and  $Q_H$  represent emission rates for NO<sub>x</sub> and VOCs. Using this definition, the sensitivity transition represents the point at which a given percent reduction in either NO<sub>x</sub> or VOC would result in the same reduction in ozone.

Tonnesen and Dennis (2000a) analyzed  $O_3$  formation in terms of radical formation equivalent, radical termination (through production of peroxides, HNO<sub>3</sub> and organic nitrates) and radical propagation, finding out that production rate for  $O_3$  is proportional to the rate of the VOCs + OH reactions. Sillman (1995) suggested that  $O_3$  was roughly proportional to the odd hydrogen source, being the ratio  $O_3/NO_z$  analogous to the quotient  $S_H/L_N$ , which is related to  $NO_x$ -VOC sensitivity. Following this basis, Sillman (1995) proposed some indicators including  $O_3/NO_y$ ,  $O_3/NO_z$ ,  $O_3/HNO_3$ ,  $H_2O_2/HNO_3$ ,  $H_2O_2/NO_z$  and the equivalent ratios with summed  $H_2O_2$  and organic peroxides.

#### 7.3 Methods

Modeling results are based the photochemical pollution event in the Western Mediterranean Basin that took place on 13-16 August, 2000 (see Section 2.1). Simulations with MM5-EMICAT2000-CMAQ show the results for 14 August, 2000, at 1200UTC, the hour of maximum simulated ground-level  $O_3$  production. This is a representative day of this episode for the domain of study of the northeastern Iberian Peninsula. The effect of controlling ozone precursors on sensitivity regimes was evaluated performing simulations for the domain with baseline emission rates for VOCs and NO<sub>x</sub> as derived from EMICAT2000 model, and reducing anthropogenic VOCs and NO<sub>x</sub> emissions on a 35% following the methods by Milford *et al.* (1994), Sillman (1995) and

Sillman *et al.* (2003). Meteorology represents the same day in order not to introduce any external influence. Three inner scenarios were deeply analyzed: (a) a 32 x 32 km<sup>2</sup> urban area centered in the city of Barcelona that comprises the Barcelona Geographical Area (BGA); (b) a 32 x 32 km<sup>2</sup> background area centered in Plana de Vic (VIC); and (c) a 32 x 32 km<sup>2</sup> industrial zone centered in Alcover (ALC). The selection of these scenarios is based in the important photochemical pollution episodes in the northeastern Iberian Peninsula.

The peculiar topography of the zone is the principal driving mechanism that contributes to the dispersion of emissions in the given domain. Maximum  $O_3$  levels in the northeastern Iberian Peninsula are measured in Plana de Vic and Alcover industrial zone (over 80 ppb). As derived from simulations (Figure 7.1), air masses from Barcelona Geographical Area are advected to the zone of Plana de Vic through river valley canalizations, transporting ozone precursors. These air masses departing from Barcelona act as photochemical reactors as they move northeast (the component of the wind is south-southwest) until they reach the region of Vic. Alcover high  $O_3$  levels have a local origin according to the high weight of heavy-chemical industry in the area.



**Figure 7.1.** Surface ozone concentration (ppb) and wind fields (m s<sup>-1</sup>) at 1200UTC of 14 August, 2000, in the northeastern Iberian Peninsula, as simulated by MM5-EMICAT2000-CMAQ air quality model.

Hourly measures of ground-level  $O_3$  simulation results in each case and scenario were compared with the measurements from 48 air quality surface stations in northeastern Spain (Catalonia), which belong to the Environmental Department of the Catalonia Government and are located within the above scenarios. The non-availability of measurements of other pollutants with an interest as indicators (e.g.  $NO_y$ ,  $H_2O_2$  or  $HNO_3$ ) leads us to focus on the evaluation of groundlevel  $O_3$ . Statistical discrete parameters (UPA, MNBE, MNGE) set by US EPA (1991), as described in Chapter 5 of this document, were utilized to establish the performance of the model.

The analysis of the results will consist of a statistical evaluation, comparing the first-layer simulations results and the values measured in the air quality stations of the domain under study. Meteorological model has also been evaluated comparing model results with surface and aloft wind measurements. Validation data of 52 surface stations located across the domain, and a radiosonde launched in Barcelona (in the center of the domain in the coast) were used.

### 7.4 Response to NO<sub>x</sub> and VOCs Controls

The correspondence between NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs sensitivity and indicator values can be examined in greater detail if quantitative methods are used to define NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs chemistry. For these purposes, we could use the definition by Sillman *et al.* (2003). Locations are defined as NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive for a specified hour if O<sub>3</sub> in the case with 35% reduced NO<sub>x</sub> is lower than O<sub>3</sub> in both the base case and in the case with 35% reduced VOCs by at least 2 ppb. Locations are classified as VOC-sensitive if the O<sub>3</sub> in the case with reduced VOCs is lower than O<sub>3</sub> in the other cases by at least 2 ppb. Locations that are neither VOC-sensitive of NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive by this definition are classified as having mixed sensitivity if O<sub>3</sub> in the cases with the reduced NO<sub>x</sub> and with reduced VOCs is lower than O<sub>3</sub> in the base case by at least 2 ppb; locations are classified as insensitive to NO<sub>x</sub> and VOCs otherwise. These definitions are time-dependent; that is, a model location may be NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive at some times and VOC-sensitive at other times. Lu and Chang (1998) used another definition, which separates extreme cases, that is, locations where only NO<sub>x</sub> or only VOCs controls are effective. Their definition is based on zero lines of simulated reduction in peak O<sub>3</sub> associated with reduced NO<sub>x</sub>, versus reduction associated with reduced VOCs (Andreani-Aksoyoglu *et al.*, 2001).

A preliminary examination of geographic patterns of responses to emission reductions at 1200UTC shows that the area with the most elevated  $O_3$  concentration (VIC), benefits from  $NO_x$  reductions (reduction of 10 ppb in ground-level  $O_3$  levels), meanwhile the same reduction emissions causes an important increment of  $O_3$  in the city of Barcelona (9 ppb) and downwind the industrial area of Tarragona (18 ppb) (Figure 7.2a). Cities located in BGA and the plume departing from the city of Barcelona benefit form VOCs reductions (10 ppb of  $O_3$ ), as well as the industrial zone of ALC (20 ppb) (Figure 7.2b). The rest of the domain is practically insensitive to VOCs reductions. This behavior is more clearly seen when studying differences between  $O_3$  levels in the case of 35% VOC reduction and 35%  $NO_x$  reduction (Figure 7.2c).



**Figure 7.2.** Reduction in peak ozone concentrations (ppb) at 1200UTC due to; (a) 35% reduction in  $NO_x$  emissions (Base case –  $NO_x$  reduction case); (b) 35% reduction in VOCs emissions (Base case – VOCs reduction case); and (c) difference between VOCs reduction case –  $NO_x$  reduction case.

Figure 7.3a illustrates the distribution of the cells of the domain according to their  $NO_x$ - or VOCsensitivity using Sillman *et al.* (2003) definition, derived from BGA, VIC and ALC scenarios. This definition indicates locations where  $NO_x$  or VOCs controls are more effective in reducing  $O_3$ production. As derived from this definition, most cells in BGA and ALC are under a VOC-sensitive regime or have a mixed sensitivity; meanwhile VIC is dominated by  $NO_x$ -sensitive chemistry.

According to the criterion of Lu and Chang (1998), the grid cells in the top-left quadrant of Figure 7.3b are characterized with NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive chemistry. They show considerable O<sub>3</sub> decrease with decreasing NO<sub>x</sub>, and insignificant O<sub>3</sub> reduction when reducing VOCs. This approach assumes that the grid cells in the top-right quadrant are sensitive to both VOCs and NO<sub>x</sub> controls. Grid cells in the bottom-right quadrant, where O<sub>3</sub> diminishes with decreasing VOCs but increases with decreasing NO<sub>x</sub>, are referred to as VOC-sensitive grid cells. The bottom-left quadrant is empty. According to this definition, most of the grid cells in BGA are VOC-sensitive, meanwhile cells in VIC have a mixed sensitivity. The domain of ALC is NO<sub>x</sub>- and VOC-sensitive for several cells; meanwhile most of the domain presents a VOC-limited regime.

# 7.4.1 Model-Measurement Comparisons

Despite that a surface measurement represents a value only at a given horizontal location and height, while the concentration predicted by the model represents a volume-averaged value, comparisons of model and measured variables represents a useful tool to depict the behavior of every case in the scenarios considered.

Table 7.1 shows the root mean square error (RMSE) of wind speed at 10m, for the lower, middle and upper troposphere and RMSE of wind direction (10 m) at 0000, 1200 and 2400UTC. The general behavior of the model shows a tendency to overestimate nocturnal surface winds and to underestimate the diurnal flow. A clear improvement is produced in the simulation during the central part of the day; at this time, the complex structure of the see-breeze described by simulation and the development of up-slope winds appears to agree in a higher grade with surface measurements. The statistics show how the model presents a better behavior within the boundary layer, and major disagreement with the radiosonde appears over 1000m above ground level.

Although there is no objective criterion set forth for a satisfactory model performance in the case of ozone, suggested values of  $\pm 10-15\%$  for MNBE,  $\pm 15-20\%$  for the UPA and  $\pm 30-35\%$  for the MNGE to be met by modeling simulations of O<sub>3</sub> have been considered for regulatory applications (Russell and Dennis, 2000; Hogrefe *et al.*, 2001).



**Figure 7.3.** Relation between ozone reductions due to  $NO_x$  controls (35% emission reduction) and VOC controls (35% emission reduction) for Barcelona Geographical Area (circles), Plana de Vic (squares) and Alcover (triangles) using (a) the definition of Sillman *et al.* (2003); and (b) the definition of Lu and Chang (1998).

RMSE V	Vind speed	(m/s)	
	0000UTC	1200UTC	2400UTC
Surface 10 m	1.71	2.04	2.00
Radiosonde <1000 m	0.84	1.04	1.31
1000-5000 m	5.03	1.55	3.7
5000-10000 m	8.45	5.15	3.94
RMSE V	Vind directi	on (°)	
	0000UTC	1200UTC	2400UTC
Surface 10 m	95.95	44.74	89.40

**Table 7.1.** RMSE statistic of wind speed, and wind direction at 0000UTC, 1200UTC and 2400UTC for 14 August, 2000 (surface values evaluated with 52 surface stations, aloft values evaluated with a radiosonde).

Figure 7.4 and Table 7.2 show the results of the evaluation of ground-level  $O_3$ . Peak  $O_3$  in the different scenarios is slightly lower than the measured values for each considered case. Comparison between model and measurements shows a good agreement when the model predicts dominant VOC-sensitive chemistry in the BGA and ALC scenarios. Here, statistical parameters of  $O_3$  evaluation get worse when reducing VOCs emissions and improve in the -35% NO<sub>x</sub> case, specially in the Barcelona Geographical Area, where UPA reduces from -18% in the VOC-reduction case until -8% in the NO<sub>x</sub>-reduction case). The same behavior is observed in Alcover. By contrast, the evaluation in VIC depicts a clear underprediction of  $O_3$  levels (around -18% of MNBE, 27% of MNGE and -13% of UPA).

Statistic parameters in the stations of Plana de Vic worsen when reducing precursor emissions on a 35%, especially in the case of 35% NO<sub>x</sub> reduction, which yields to a more important underestimation of  $O_3$  levels in the area because of the NO<sub>x</sub>-limited regime of this scenario. It is noteworthy that all model cases meet the criteria established by US EPA for model evaluations in the case of  $O_3$ .

Model-measurement comparison suggests that the  $O_3$ -production chemistry may not be sufficiently reactive, possibly because of an underestimation in reactive VOCs and/or an overestimation in NO<sub>x</sub> emissions. The inferior bias compared to the observations of air quality stations for the cells in ALC and BGA may be due to the pervasive emissions in the near-source cells and therefore emissions strength better fits measurements. Differences in the  $O_3$ concentrations between model and measurements are higher in the domain of VIC. This may be due because the photochemical  $O_3$  production is subdued in background cells, being most of the  $O_3$  transported from the BGA-departing plume; and hence, the relative contribution from the different emissions is not as significant as in the urban or industrial cells.



**Figure 7.4.** Measured O<sub>3</sub> (diamonds) versus modeled O<sub>3</sub> for August 14, 2000, for the base case (solid line, squares), 35% NO<sub>x</sub> reduction case (dashed, circles) and the 35% VOCs reduction case (dashed, triangles) in stations of (a) Barcelona (BGA); (b) Vic; and (c) Alcover. Statistics are shown in Table 7.2.

Barcelo	ona Geographi	cal Area (Urbai	n)
Max Measured (ppb)		49	•
	Base Case	-35% NO <sub>x</sub>	-35% VOC
Max Simulated (ppb)	42	45	40
MNBE (%)	-17.31	-10.16	-19.36
MNGE (%)	24.11	23.76	28.16
UPA (%)	-13.56	-7.94	-17.52
PI	lana de Vic (Ba	ackground)	
Max Measured (ppb)	_	88	
	Base Case	-35% NO <sub>x</sub>	-35% VOC
Max Simulated (ppb)	77	71	75
MNBE (%)	-18.64	-19.69	-22.02
MNGE (%)	27.62	31.16	28.39
UPA (%)	-12.90	-19.84	-15.14
	Alcover (Ind	ustrial)	
Max Measured (ppb)		64	
	Base Case	-35% NO <sub>x</sub>	-35% VOC
Max Simulated (ppb)	58	60	56
MNBE (%)	-14.07	-11.75	-15.68
MNGE (%)	19.58	19.31	20.20
UPA (%)	-8.31	-5.12	-11.47

 Table 7.2.
 Evaluation of ozone concentrations for 14 August, 2000, according to the scenario: mean normalized bias error (MNBE), mean normalized gross error (MNGE) and unpaired peak accuracy (UPA).

Despite these differences, the link between NO<sub>x</sub>-VOC sensitivity and photochemical indicators is largely unaffected by changes in model assumptions, including assumed emission rates for both anthropogenic and biogenic species (Sillman *et al.*, 1998).

### 7.4.2 Use of Photochemical Indicators

**NO**<sub>y</sub>. NO<sub>y</sub> works as an indicator because it is related to the balance between VOCs and NO<sub>x</sub> seen by an air mass. In addition, the association of ozone sensitivity with NO<sub>y</sub> reflects a feature of photochemical evolution that is independent of initial VOCs/NO<sub>x</sub> ratios (Milford *et al.*, 1994). Figure 7.5 shows reductions in peak O<sub>3</sub> associated with 35% reductions in anthropogenic VOCs and NO<sub>x</sub> emissions, plotted against the base case NO<sub>y</sub> concentration predicted for the grid cells at 1200UTC. Reductions in VOCs have little impact on peak O<sub>3</sub> in locations where NO<sub>y</sub> is low, but as NO<sub>y</sub> increases, the reduction in O<sub>3</sub> associated with reduced VOCs increases in an approximately log-linear way. In all cases, a crossover occurs at 4 ppb NO<sub>y</sub>, where reductions in VOCs become more effective than reductions in NO<sub>x</sub>. For the BGA and ALC scenarios, Figures 7.5a and 7.5c show a sharp delineation between VOC-sensitive (corresponding to NO<sub>y</sub> concentrations above 4 ppb) and NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive locations (concentrations under this threshold). The overlap between NO<sub>x</sub>- and VOC-sensitive locations occupies a very narrow range.



**Figure 7.5.** Predicted reduction in peak  $O_3$  (in ppb) resulting from a 35% reduction in the emission rate for  $NO_x$  (diamonds) and VOCs (squares) plotted against  $NO_y$  (ppb) in the simulation for (a) Barcelona Geographical Area; (b) Plana de Vic; and (c) Alcover (1200UTC).

Reductions of VOCs in ALC yield higher  $O_3$  reductions than in BGA. Nevertheless, results from VIC scenario (Figure 7.5b) illustrate a less successful correlation between sensitivity and NO<sub>y</sub>. Here, the range of NO<sub>y</sub> values associated with the transition regime is wider (Table 7.3). The difference in NO<sub>x</sub>-VOC sensitivity between this background scenario and the urban and industrial scenarios is reflected by higher NO<sub>y</sub> in the latter, despite NO<sub>x</sub>- and VOC-sensitive photochemistry occurs virtually at the same NO<sub>y</sub> in each.

**NO**<sub>z</sub>. NO<sub>z</sub>, representing the sum of NO<sub>x</sub> reaction products (NO<sub>y</sub>-NO<sub>x</sub>), can also be used as an indicator for sensitivity. Generally, NO<sub>z</sub> has a worse correlation with sensitivity than NO<sub>y</sub> with a broader overlap between both regimes (Sillman, 1995). The indicators based on NO<sub>y</sub> ratios can all be used for NO<sub>z</sub>, and vice versa. Results for O<sub>3</sub>/NO<sub>z</sub> indicator are shown in Figure 7.6. For BGA and ALC (Figures 7.6a and 7.6c), the performance of O<sub>3</sub>/NO<sub>z</sub> as an indicator is comparable to NO<sub>y</sub> with a well-defined transition between NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive chemistry (O<sub>3</sub>/NO<sub>z</sub> > 22) and VOC-sensitive chemistry (indicator values under 18). For VIC scenario (Figure 7.6b), this indicator performs much worse, as reflected in Table 7.3. Transition regime is also achieved around O<sub>3</sub>/NO<sub>z</sub>  $\approx$  20, but the overlapping of regimes is wider, as derived from simulations. Therefore, results show a strong contrast in the performance of the indicator when evaluating sensitivity regimes between different scenarios.

**HCHO and NO**<sub>y</sub>. An interesting feature of HCHO/NO<sub>y</sub> as an indicator is that this correlation represents the impact of changes in VOCs emissions. The ratio HCHO/NO<sub>y</sub> functions as a reactivity-weighted VOCs/NO<sub>x</sub> ratio, since production of HCHO is roughly proportional to the summed rate of reactions of VOCs with OH. Therefore, the ratio HCHO/NO<sub>y</sub> can also be associated with NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs sensitivity through the analysis of odd hydrogen. Low HCHO/NO<sub>y</sub> is associated with VOC-sensitive ozone, a result that parallels the relation between ozone sensitivity and VOCs/NO<sub>x</sub> (Sillman and He, 2002). The correlation between sensitivity and HCHO/NO<sub>y</sub> is comparable with NO<sub>y</sub> in its consistency, although its usefulness is partially compromised by its relatively narrow range of values. The model predicts the crossover between NO<sub>x</sub>- and VOC-sensitivity chemistry in Barcelona Geographical Area and Alcover. Nevertheless, large fractions of the model domains are associated with overlap between NO<sub>x</sub>- and VOC-sensitive ranges (Table 7.3).

 $H_2O_2$  and  $HNO_3$ . Representation of  $H_2O_2$  and  $HNO_3$  chemistry involves many complex reactions and possible unknowns that become very important under low  $NO_x/VOCs$  ratios (Kuhn *et al.*, 1998). The connection between  $NO_x$ -VOCs sensitivity and the ratio  $H_2O_2/HNO_3$  is strong in the scenarios simulated. Nevertheless, this ratio behaves as an average indicator bearing in mind the overlap between  $NO_x$ - and VOC-sensitive regimes. This transition (Figure 7.8) takes place at a value of  $H_2O_2/HNO_3$  of approximately 2.5-3 for the scenarios considered, being an accurate indicator in BGA and ALC (Table 7.3).



**Figure 7.6.** Predicted reduction in peak  $O_3$  (in ppb) resulting from a 35% reduction in the emission rate for  $NO_x$  (diamonds) and VOCs (squares) plotted against  $O_3/NO_z$  in the simulation for (a) Barcelona Geographical Area; (b) Plana de Vic; and (c) Alcover (1200UTC).



**Figure 7.7.** Predicted reduction in peak  $O_3$  (in ppb) resulting from a 35% reduction in the emission rate for  $NO_x$  (diamonds) and VOCs (squares) plotted against HCHO/NO<sub>y</sub> in the simulation for (a) Barcelona Geographical Area; (b) Plana de Vic; and (c) Alcover (1200UTC).



**Figure 7.8.** Predicted reduction in peak  $O_3$  (in ppb) resulting from a 35% reduction in the emission rate for NO<sub>x</sub> (diamonds) and VOCs (squares) plotted against H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>/HNO<sub>3</sub> in the simulation for (a) Barcelona Geographical Area; (b) Plana de Vic; and (c) Alcover (1200UTC).

 $H_2O_2/NO_y$  indicator is also included in Table 7.3, showing a similar pattern, with transition values around 0.5. For  $H_2O_2/NO_z$ , its behavior strongly depends on the domain of study, being the transition value around 0.8. The lack of a relationship between  $H_2O_2$  and  $HNO_3$  is partially explained by their tendency to assume different correlative patterns in  $NO_x$ - versus VOC-sensitive conditions. There is no consistent correlation between the simulated  $H_2O_2$  and HCHO or between  $H_2O_2$  and  $O_3$ . However, there is a triple correlation among  $O_3$ ,  $H_2O_2$  and  $NO_x$  reaction products. The sum  $H_2O_2 + NO_z$  represents the cumulative sink for odd hydrogen and may be expected to correlate with  $O_3$ . As depicted in Figure 7.9, a correlation of this type is observed in all domains; the same type of relationship is observed for  $NO_z$  and  $HNO_3$ . This view, presented by Sillman (1995), emphasizes  $O_3$  as a source for odd hydrogen, either directly or through association with intermediate hydrocarbons, and rates of formation for both peroxides and reactive nitrogen as limited by size of the odd hydrogen source. The transition from  $NO_x$ - to VOC-sensitive chemistry is linked with the replacement of peroxides by  $HNO_3$  as the dominant sink for odd hydrogen, and therefore by a decreasing ratio of  $O_3$  to reactive nitrogen.

**Extent of Reaction.** The definition of extent of reaction -EOR- (Blanchard *et al.*, 1999; Blanchard and Stoeckenius, 2001) used in this work has been modified in order be expressed as a function on NO<sub>x</sub> and NO<sub>y</sub> (equation 7.3):

$$Extent = \left[1 - \frac{NO_x}{1.3 \cdot NO_y}\right] \cdot 0.67$$
(7.3)

The predicted  $O_3$  response versus EOR exhibits considerable variability and a range of indeterminate values (0.4 - 0.6); nevertheless, the delimitation of the transition between NO<sub>x</sub>- and VOC-limitation is fairly sharp. This parameter is correlated with NO<sub>x</sub>-VOC sensitivity. BGA is related with the lowest values of the noon EOR (under 0.35); ALC presents EOR values between 0.35 and 0.5, corresponding to primarily VOC-sensitive sites. Meanwhile VIC (where most cells are NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive) presents values of EOR over 0.55.

**NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs parameter.** It is also possible to develop a statistical correlation between NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs sensitivity and model indicator values if a single numerical value is used to express model NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs sensitivity. We will use the NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs parameter (equation 7.4) defined by Sillman *et al.* (1997):

NO<sub>x</sub> - VOC parameter = 
$$\frac{[O_3]_N - [O_3]_V}{\max\{[O_3]_0; [O_3]_N; [O_3]_V\} - \min\{[O_3]_0; [O_3]_N; [O_3]_V\}}$$
(7.4)

where  $[O_3]_0$  represents  $O_3$  at the specified time and location in the base case scenario,  $[O_3]_N$  represents  $O_3$  in the simulation with reduced NO<sub>x</sub> and  $[O_3]_V$  represents  $O_3$  in the simulation with reduced VOCs.



**Figure 7.9.** HNO<sub>3</sub> (circles), NO<sub>z</sub> (squares) and  $H_2O_2 + NO_z$  (triangles) versus O<sub>3</sub>, all in ppb, at 1200UTC in simulations for (a) Barcelona Geographical Area; (b) Plana de Vic and (c) Alcover.

The parameter is positive whenever  $O_3$  is lower in the reduced-VOCs simulation than in the reduced-NO<sub>x</sub> simulation. When the  $O_3$  reduction associated with reduced VOCs is twice as large as the  $O_3$  reduction for reduced NO<sub>x</sub>, the parameter is 0.5; and when model NO<sub>x</sub> reductions result in either no change or an increase in  $O_3$ , the parameter is 1. Negative values represent equivalent NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive results.

The quality of the NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs indicator correlation is demonstrated by three factors (Sillman *et al.*, 1997): (1) the size of the difference between indicator values associated with NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive, VOC-sensitive and transitional chemistry; (2) the lack of overlap between indicator values associated with NO<sub>x</sub>- and VOC-sensitive locations; and (3) the consistency of the NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs transition value in different simulations. As seen in Table 7.3 and Figure 7.10, this parameter correlates with model values for most photochemical indicators. Correlation coefficients ( $r^2$ ) of 0.50 or higher are found for all simulations and indicators. Correlation is lower for Plana de Vic since most of the domain is strongly NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive, and the wide range of indicator values among NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive locations.

# 7.4.3 Uncertainties

The use of based-model chemical relationship involves uncertainties based on model simplifications (Jiménez *et al.*, 2003). We define the uncertainty of the indicators as the fraction of the model domain with indicator values that are within 20% of the range of indicator values associated with the opposite  $NO_x$ -VOCs sensitivity. This parameter is recorded for each indicator and each domain in Table 7.3 and will help identifying their usefulness.

The extent of overlap between NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive and VOC-sensitive ranges for indicator species and model domains provides a partial representation of the uncertainties associated with the sensitivity-indicator correlations. The uncertainty factor is relatively higher for every indicator involving H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> and HNO<sub>3</sub>, especially in VIC, which is mainly a NO<sub>x</sub>-limited scenario, since of the high solubilities of these species, which makes them sensitive to surface deposition and aerosol formation rates (as stated by Sillman, 1995), which involve vague representation in photochemical models. H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> is vulnerable to reaction rate and mechanism uncertainties, so it must be considered carefully when using it as an indicator of sensitivity regime. Smallest uncertainties are achieved when using indicators related to total reactive nitrogen (NO<sub>v</sub> or O<sub>3</sub>/NO<sub>v</sub>), in the order of 5% for BGA, 40% for VIC and 10% for ALC. NO<sub>z</sub>-related indicators (NO<sub>z</sub>,  $O_3/NO_z$ ,  $H_2O_2/NO_z$ ) carry a high uncertainty when used in VIC domain (NO<sub>x</sub>-limited); nevertheless, its uncertainty decreases in VOC-limited domains as BGA or ALC. NOz is expected to vary significantly in response to changes in radiation and production rates of odd hydrogen. The uncertainty in the relationship between extent of reaction and NO<sub>x</sub>- or VOC-sensitive regimes is also low, since transition range is well delimited; in addition, it exhibits a good correlation with the NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs parameter as previously defined.









**Figure 7.10.** Indicators versus NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs parameter at 1200UTC in simulations for (a) Barcelona Geographical Area; (b) Plana de Vic; and (c) Alcover.

Chapter 7. Ozone response to precursor controls in very complex terrains

Table 7.3. Distribution of photochemical indicator values for NO<sub>x</sub>- and VOC-sensitive chemistry.

Indicator		NO <sub>x</sub> -Sensitiv	re Locations			VOC-Sensiti	ive Locations			
	Range	2 <sup>nd</sup> Percentile	50th Percentile	98th Percentile	Range	2 <sup>nd</sup> Percentile	50 <sup>th</sup> Percentile	98 <sup>th</sup> Percentile	Uncertainty	Correlation r <sup>2</sup>
NO <sub>V</sub> (ppb)										
Barcelona Area	5.24-6.60	5.26	5.44	6.60	5.95-14.16	6.08	9.06	13.68	0.07	0.73
Plana de Vic	1.98-12.06	2.37	5.74	11.69	3.83-12.06	4.34	7.66	12.02	0.41	0.53
Alcover	2.28-5.86	2.31	3.18	5.42	3.45-23.33	3.93	12.19	22.05	0.22	0.71
NO <sub>z</sub> (ppb)										
Barcelona Area	3.67-4.17	3.68	3.78	4.17	1.88-6.72	2.00	3.17	6.61	0.05	0.32
Plana de Vic	1.69-9.68	1.88	5.15	9.55	2.65-9.68	3.00	6.35	09.6	0.49	0.40
Alcover	1.94-4.18	1.95	2.53	3.91	2.21-9.07	2.41	6.31	8.90	0.28	0.80
HCHO/NO <sub>V</sub>										
Barcelona Area	0.34-0.38	0.34	0.37	0.38	0.18-0.53	0.20	0.31	0.51	0.09	0.78
Plana de Vic	0.28-0.87	0.32	0.45	0.77	0.33-0.60	0.34	0.42	0.55	0.52	0.40
Alcover	0.77-1.16	0.78	0.93	1.14	0.25-0.99	0.28	0.50	0.84	0.23	0.50
H <sub>2</sub> O <sub>2</sub> /NO <sub>2</sub>										
Barcelona Area	0.76-0.91	0.76	0.86	0.91	0.39-2.03	0.40	1.09	1.95	0.05	0.55
Plana de Vic	0.30-2.03	0.32	0.64	1.81	0.30-1.28	0.31	0.48	1.09	0.47	0.44
Alcover	0.74-1.75	0.82	1.28	1.74	0.33-1.54	0.34	0.47	1.38	0.25	0.87
H <sub>2</sub> O <sub>2</sub> /NO <sub>y</sub>										
Barcelona Area	0.48-0.64	0.48	0.57	0.64	0.19-0.60	0.19	0.38	0.59	0.18	0.75
Plana de Vic	0.24-1.74	0.27	0.57	1.51	0.24-0.88	0.24	0.40	0.76	0.41	0.50
Alcover	0.53-1.49	0.59	1.03	1.47	0.13-0.95	0.14	0.24	0.83	0.25	0.91
O <sub>3</sub> /NO <sub>z</sub>										
Barcelona Area	13.99-15.36	13.99	14.88	15.33	9.14-22.94	9.15	15.87	22.25	0.04	0.60
Plana de Vic	8.16-28.99	8.26	12.32	26.48	8.16-19.43	8.21	10.63	17.03	0.50	0.41
Alcover	13.93-23.64	14.59	19.43	23.64	7.08-21.20	7.16	8.93	20.04	0.27	0.87

Air quality modeling in very complex terrains: ozone dynamics in the northeastern Iberian Peninsula

Table 7.3 (continued). Distribution of photochemical indicator values for NOx- and VOC-sensitive chemistry.

Indicator		NO <sub>x</sub> -Sensitiv	re Locations			VOC-Sensitiv	re Locations			
	Range	2 <sup>nd</sup> Percentile	50 <sup>th</sup> Percentile	98th Percentile	Range	2 <sup>nd</sup> Percentile	50 <sup>th</sup> Percentile	98 <sup>th</sup> Percentile	Uncertainty	Correlation r <sup>2</sup>
O3/NOy										
Barcelona Area	8.85-10.76	8.85	10.45	10.73	3.13-9.17	3.47	5.64	8.15	0.02	0.75
Plana de Vic	6.45-24.84	6.57	10.79	21.59	6.35-13.43	6.54	8.83	12.51	0.38	0.50
Alcover	9.92-20.14	10.56	15.41	19.95	2.72-14.73	2.77	4.84	12.81	0.12	0.93
O <sub>3</sub> /HNO <sub>3</sub>										
Barcelona Area	17.29-18.75	17.29	18.09	18.73	10.70-32.09	11.14	20.88	30.84	0.04	0.57
Plana de Vic	11.72-49.40	11.93	17.18	44.33	11.72-26.39	11.78	15.27	23.20	0.59	0.39
Alcover	20.31-36.07	20.99	27.99	35.92	8.49-27.64	8.70	11.09	26.93	0.22	0.84
H <sub>2</sub> O <sub>2</sub> /HNO <sub>3</sub>										
Barcelona Area	0.94-1.12	0.94	1.05	1.11	0.49-2.75	0.50	1.49	2.61	0.04	0.50
Plana de Vic	0.44-3.45	0.47	0.89	3.04	0.44-1.74	0.45	0.69	1.45	0.57	0.41
Alcover	1.08-2.66	1.17	1.84	2.65	0.42-1.92	0.43	0.56	1.80	0.18	0.85
EOR										
Barcelona Area	0.48-0.53	0.48	0.51	0.52	0.24-0.54	0.24	0.36	0.50	0.07	0.80
Plana de Vic	0.50-0.65	0.51	0.60	0.64	0.39-0.63	0.43	0.57	0.63	0.63	0.57
Alcover	0.48-0.59	0.49	0.56	0.59	0.35-0.58	0.35	0.42	0.54	0.30	0.77

7.22

Table 7.3 presents a summary of transition regimes for all indicators, as well as  $2^{nd}$ ,  $50^{th}$  and  $98^{th}$  percentiles of indicators in NO<sub>x</sub>- and VOC-sensitive locations for both scenarios. Results show that median values for indicators involving NO<sub>y</sub> or NO<sub>z</sub> species diverge in a factor of approximately 2-3 in the scenario of BGA and VIC; on the other side, no relevant difference is shown for these indicators in VIC, a domain whose cells are mainly NO<sub>x</sub>-limited. For O<sub>3</sub>/HNO<sub>3</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>/HNO<sub>3</sub>, NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive locations exhibit a higher value than VOC-sensitive locations in both domains by a factor of 2. The 98<sup>th</sup> percentile of the distribution of indicator values for NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive locations in the case of NO<sub>y</sub>, NO<sub>z</sub>, demonstrating the robustness of the correlation between indicator values and NO<sub>x</sub>-VOC sensitivity. Other indicators that permit us establish an accurate transition regime independently of the domain considered are HCHO/NO<sub>y</sub>, O<sub>3</sub>/NO<sub>y</sub>, H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>/HNO<sub>3</sub> and extent of reaction, where the 98<sup>th</sup> percentile VOC-sensitive value is of the same magnitude than the  $2^{nd}$  percentile NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive value.

#### 7.5 Conclusions

This study has provided a case study of how the method of photochemical indicators can be used to evaluate O<sub>3</sub>-NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs sensitivity in very complex terrains, showing the correlation between photochemical indicators and simulated NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs sensitivity in a terrain as complex as the northeastern Iberian Peninsula during a typical re-circulation episode of photochemical pollution. The model evaluation shown here is relatively simple to perform and provides a test for sensitivity evaluation and to establish control policies for ozone-precursor emissions. Nevertheless, indicators are subject to many uncertainties, including deposition rates, aerosol interactions and case-to-case variations.

Results shown suggest that  $O_3$  chemistry in the Barcelona city plume arriving at VIC is close to the transition between VOC-sensitive and NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive conditions. Nevertheless, BGA and ALC present a high VOC-sensitive behavior due to the high traffic and industrial NO<sub>x</sub> emissions. Predicted NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs sensitivity varies considerably among the three model scenarios. NO<sub>x</sub>-sensitive chemistry is associated with lower O<sub>3</sub> and NO<sub>y</sub>; the varying NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs predictions occur despite O<sub>3</sub> is similar in all three scenarios.

Variations in indicator behavior are analytically linked to variations in the  $O_3$  production efficiency per primary radical production. In general,  $H_2O_2$ - and  $HNO_3$ - derived indicators entail higher uncertainties since transition regimes between  $NO_x$  and VOCs sensitivity cover a wide range, because those indicators (and their ratio) are affected by changes in environmental conditions.  $NO_y$  and  $O_3/NO_y$  are revealed as the most accurate indicators to assess sensitivity in the domains studied, attending to the narrow transition regime between  $NO_x$ - and VOC-sensitive chemistry and the low uncertainty observed; on the other side,  $NO_z$ -indicators correlates worse than  $NO_y$ and implies a higher uncertainty. The behavior of  $NO_z$  tends to disagree for differently polluted domains; hence, it performs better in VOC-sensitive (BGA, a metropolitan area; or ALC, an industrial zone characterized by high  $NO_x$  and VOC emissions) than in  $NO_x$ -sensitive scenarios as VIC. The extent of reaction also performs as a good indicator to separate  $NO_x$  and VOCs sensitive regimes. The results given in this study indicate the necessity to consider the differences in the conditions of the domains when applying the indicator approach.

The biggest weakness of these indicators is the difficulty in testing the predicted indicator- $NO_x$ -VOCs relationship against ambient measurements. In addition, the indicator method provides information about  $NO_x$ -VOCs sensitivity at the time and place considered.  $NO_x$ -VOCs sensitivity varies with time of day, changes from event to event, and by location within a same domain.

# 7.6 References

- Atkinson, R., 2000. Atmospheric chemistry of VOCs and NO<sub>x</sub>. Atmospheric Environment, **34**, 2063-2101.
- Andreani-Aksoyoglu, S., Lu, C.-H., Keller, J. Prévôt, A.S.H., Chang, J.S., 2001. Variability of indicator values for ozone production sensitivity: a model study in Switzerland and San Joaquin Valley (California). Atmospheric Environment, **35**, 5593-5604.
- Blanchard, C.L., Lurmann, F.W., Roth, P.M., Jeffries, H.E., Korc, M., 1999. The use of ambient data to corroborate analyses of ozone control strategies. Atmospheric Environment, **33**, 369-381.
- Blanchard, C.L., Fairley, D., 2001. Spatial mapping of VOC and NO<sub>x</sub>-limitation of ozone formation in central California. Atmospheric Environment, **35**, 3861-3873.
- Blanchard, C.L., Stoeckenius, T., 2001. Ozone response to precursor controls: comparison of analysis methods with the predictions of photochemical air quality simulation models. Atmospheric Environment, **35**, 1203-1215.
- Hogrefe, C., Rao, S.T., Kasibhatla, P., Hao, W., Sistla, G., Mathur, R., McHenry, J., 2001. Evaluating the performance of regional-scale photochemical modeling systems: Part II – ozone predictions. Atmospheric Environment, **35**, 4175-4188.
- Jiménez, P., Dabdub, D., Baldasano, J.M., 2003. Comparison of photochemical mechanisms for air quality modeling. Atmospheric Environment, **37**, 4179-4194.
- Kleinman, L.I., Daum, P.H., Lee, J.H., Lee, Y.-N., Nunnermacjerm L.J. Springston, S.R., Newman, L., Weinstein-Lloyd, J., Sillman, S., 1997. Dependence of ozone production on NO<sub>x</sub> and hydrocarbons in the troposphere. Geophysical Research Letters, **24**, 2299-2302.
- Kuhn, M., Builtjes, P.J.H., Poppe, D., Simpson, D., Stockwell, W.R., Andersson-Skold, Y., Baart, A., Das, M., Fiedler, F., Hov, O., Kirchner, F., Makar, P.A., Milford, J.B., Roemer, M.G.M., Ruhnke, R., Strand, A., Vogel, B., Vogel, H., 1998. Intercomparison of the gas-phase chemistry in several chemistry and transport models. Atmospheric Environment, **32**, 693-709.
- Lu, C.-H., Chang, J., 1998. On the indicator-based approach to assess ozone sensitivities and emission features. Journal of Geophysical Research, **103**, 3453-3462.
- Milford, J.B., Gao, D., Sillman, S., Blossey, P., Russell, A.G., 1994. Total reactive nitrogen (NO<sub>y</sub>) as an indicator of the sensitivity of ozone to reductions in hydrocarbon and NOx emissions. Journal of Geophysical Research, **99** (D2), 3533-3542.
- Russell, A., Dennis, R., 2000. NARSTO critical review of photochemical models and modeling. Atmospheric Environment, **34**, 2283-2324.

- Sillman, S., 1995. The use of NO<sub>y</sub>, H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> and HNO<sub>3</sub> as indicators for ozone-NO<sub>x</sub>-hydrocarbon sensitivity in urban locations. Journal of Geophysical Research, **100** (D7), 14175-14188.
- Sillman, S., He, D., Cardelino, C., Imhoff, R.E., 1997. The use of photochemical indicators to evaluate ozone-NO<sub>x</sub>-hydrocarbon sensitivity: case studies from Atlanta, New York and Los Angeles. Journal of the Air & Waste Management Association, **47**, 1030-1040.
- Sillman, S., He, D., Pippin, M.R., Daum, P.H., Imre, D.G., Kleinman, L.I., Lee, J.H., Weinstein-Lloyd, J., 1998. Model correlations for ozone, reactive nitrogen and peroxides for Nashville in comparison with measurements: implications for VOC-NO<sub>x</sub> sensitivity. Journal of Geophysical Research, **103**, 22629 - 22644.
- Sillman, S., 1999. The relation between ozone, NO<sub>x</sub> and hydrocarbons in urban and polluted rural environments. Atmospheric Environment, **33**, 1821-1845.
- Sillman, S., He, D., 2002. Some theoretical results concerning O<sub>3</sub>-NO<sub>x</sub>-VOC chemistry and NOx-VOC indicators. Journal of Geophysical Research, **107** (D22), 4659, doi:10.1029/2001JD001123, 2002.
- Sillman, S., Vautard, R. Menut, L., Kley, D., 2003. O<sub>3</sub>-NO<sub>x</sub>-VOC sensitivity and NO<sub>x</sub>-VOC indicators in Paris: results from models and atmospheric pollution over the Paris area (ESQUIF) measurements. Journal of Geophysical Research, **108** (D17), 8563, doi:10.1029/2002JD001561, 2003.
- Tonnesen, G.S., Dennis, R.L., 2000a. Analysis of radical propagation efficiency to assess ozone sensitivity to hydrocarbons and NO<sub>x</sub>, 1, Local indicators of instantaneous odd oxygen production sensitivity. Journal of Geophysical Research, **105**, 9213-9226.
- Tonnesen, G.S., Dennis, R.L., 2000b. Analysis of radical propagation efficiency to assess ozone sensitivity to hydrocarbons and NO<sub>x</sub>, 2, Long-lived species as indicators of ozone concentration sensitivity. Journal of Geophysical Research, **105**, 9227-9242.
- US EPA, 1991. Guideline for Regulatory Application of the Urban Airshed Model. US EPA Report No. EPA-450/4-91-013. Office of Air and Radiation, Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards, Technical Support Division. Research Triangle Park, North Carolina, US.